



Replacement of Fish Meal with Fermented Soybean Meal in Fish Feed: A Review

Fittrie Meyllianawaty Pratiwy^{a++} and Dina Amalia Triyani^{a#*}

^a *Department of Fisheries, Faculty of Fisheries and Marine Science, Padjadjaran University, Jl. Raya Sumedang, Sumedang, Indonesia.*

Authors' contributions

This work was carried out in collaboration between both authors. Both authors read and approved the final manuscript.

Article Information

DOI: 10.9734/AJFAR/2022/v20i6518

Open Peer Review History:

This journal follows the Advanced Open Peer Review policy. Identity of the Reviewers, Editor(s) and additional Reviewers, peer review comments, different versions of the manuscript, comments of the editors, etc are available here: <https://www.sdiarticle5.com/review-history/94720>

Review Article

Received: 12/10/2022

Accepted: 19/12/2022

Published: 23/12/2022

ABSTRACT

Soybean meal is a source of vegetable protein to replace fish meal which is widely used because it has a high protein content (26.7 -65.5%), balanced amino acids and easy to find compared to other plants. Besides being high in protein, soybean meal also contains anti-nutrients which can inhibit growth, feed effectiveness, and lower nutrient utilization in fish. So it is necessary to process feed ingredients to remove anti-nutritional content. Fermentation can be a solution for utilizing soybean meal by reducing the anti-nutrient content and crude fiber to produce components that can be utilized properly, such as protein, β -glucan, vitamins, mannan oligosaccharides, organic acids, and antibiotics. The type of fermented soybean meal that is widely used is *Bacillus* spp., *Aspergillus* spp., *Lactobacillus* spp., and yeast. The purpose of this literature review study was to determine the effect of replacing fish meal with fermented soybean meal in fish feed. Several types of fish that have been fed using fermented soybean meal include seabasses, green snapper, mud grouper, rainbow trout, pomfret star, tilapia, and turbot. Fermentation of soybean meal to fish can increase

⁺⁺ Lecturer;

[#] Student;

^{*}Corresponding author: Email: dina20001@mail.unpad.ac.id;

growth rate, gut morphology, gut microecology, feed digestibility, feed preferences, fish innate immunity and produce antimicrobial peptides. Soybean meal fermentation as a substitute for fish meal has been shown to have a good effect on fish so that it can continue to be developed to increase the utilization of soybean meal.

Keywords: Fish feed; fermentation; soybean meal; growth; digestibility.

1. INTRODUCTION

Fish meal has a high protein content (around 44.2-58.87%) [1] so that it can be used as the main protein source in the manufacture of carnivore fish feed with additional ingredients such as a balanced amino acid content and other growth promoting factors [2]. However, reducing the use of fishmeal can be a challenge in promoting the development of a sustainable aquaculture industry due to increased feed prices stemming from large amounts of wild catch which can damage marine ecosystems [3]. Dwindling fishery resources and increasing fish prices are the main factors in urging nutritionists to replace fish meal without reducing the protein content and easy to find [4].

A feed ingredient that can be used as a protein source to replace fish meal is soybean meal, because the price is cheap, the availability is wide, the supply is stable and it does not compete with food ingredients compared to fish meal [4]. Soybean meal is a by-product of processed soybean oil with a high protein content (40-50%), high carbohydrates (57.15%) and balanced amino acids, so that it can be used as the main protein source in the manufacture of animal feed [5,6]. The advantages of soybean meal are that it has high digestibility in fish and has a pleasant aroma when compared to fish meal. However, the drawback of soybean meal is that its use as an alternative raw material is still limited because there are anti-nutritional ingredients such as oligosaccharides, saponins, protease inhibitors and phytic acid [7] which can inhibit growth, physiological conditions and feed utilization so that the nutrients in the feed are not absorbed completely [8].

Substituting fish meal with soybean meal often results in stunted growth and lower utilization of nutrients in feed [9,10]. Previous research suggests reducing or even eliminating the antinutrient content in soybean meal using various techniques to increase the nutritional value content [11]. So it is necessary to process feed raw materials before being given to fish [12].

Fermentation is a process of chemical changes in certain materials with the help of enzyme activity originating from microorganisms [13]. The function of the fermentation process is to degrade the anti-nutritional content in soybean meal, fiber, oligosaccharides and protein, besides that it can also improve the quality of vegetable protein and make other beneficial components such as probiotics and prebiotics [14]. Making a review of this journal aims to determine the effect of replacing fish meal with fermented soybean meal in fish feed.

2. SOYBEAN MEAL AS A SUBSTITUTE FOR FISH MEAL

Soybean meal is a source of vegetable protein which is often considered as a substitute for fish meal. Soybean meal has a fairly high effective content such as protein (40-50%) , amino acids which are relatively balanced and easy to find compared to other plants [15]. The effect of using soybean meal as a substitute for fish meal on the growth and health of fish depends on the species and feeding habits of the fish [16]. In general, the use of soybean meal is well received by herbivorous and omnivorous fish compared to carnivore fish. Soybean meal can replace part or all of fish meal without inhibiting the growth and health of herbivorous and omnivorous fish [17]. The replacement of 75% fish meal with soybean meal showed no significant difference in the growth of digestive enzyme activity and the antioxidant status of tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus*) [18]. However, the use of soybean meal in food for carnivore fish such as orange spotted grouper (30%) [19], Eur operatic seabass (25%), and turbot (30%) [20] requires a benchmark in feeding soybean meal because it can inhibit performance. growth of the carnivore fish.

The high amount of soybean meal used in feed can have an adverse effect on growth, feed utilization and fish health status [21]. Substitution of 24% fish meal with soybean meal in carnivore fish has an adverse impact on feed efficiency, lipids, protein, metabolism, growth and health of Japanese flounder (*Paralichthys olivaceus*) [22]. The use of soybean meal as a substitute for fish

meal which exceeds 49% will show an adverse effect on the growth, feed conversion and digestibility of the Chinese sucker (*Myxocyprinus asiaticus*) [23]. Several studies have stated that feeding fish fermented with soybean meal in aquaculture ponds can affect immune function, adverse inflation responses and stress in fish [3]. The anti-nutrient content in soybean meal raw materials can inhibit the efficiency of feeding so that the nutritional content is disturbed, such as the content of phytic acid [24]. In general, plant-type feed ingredients contain anti-nutrients which are the main source of phosphate and cause low feed solubility in monogastric animals. The strategy that can be used to remove anti-nutritional content in soybean meal is by utilizing the fermentation process by microorganisms which has many benefits such as increasing the nutrient content and increasing the solubility of vegetable protein sources by fish [25].

3. FERMENTATION FUNCTION

Fermentation is a method of breaking down organic compounds into simpler compounds by utilizing microorganisms. Fermented products are usually biodegradable easily and their nutritional value increases from the original material. Besides being able to break down complex compounds into simpler ones, the fermentation process can also synthesize several complex vitamins. The fermentation process has the benefit of converting complex organic materials such as carbohydrates, proteins and fats into easily digestible molecules. In addition, fermentation can also change the aroma and taste to be easily liked by organisms and can synthesize protein. Another benefit of the fermentation process is that it can reduce toxic compounds, and the shelf life becomes longer, so that the basic ingredients produced have better economic value [12]. The advantages of the fermentation process are increasing protein content, feed digestibility and reducing crude fiber so that the nutrients in the feed can be absorbed perfectly [26]. Additionally, it ferments with *Bacillus subtilis* can reduce the trypsin content in soybean meal from 3.38 to 1.65 mg/g [27].

This method is widely used in increasing the utilization of fish meal substitutes for soybean meal [28]. Previous studies have established fermentation as an effective method for improving the quality of soybean meal by producing probiotics or prebiotics. So that it can improve nutrient digestibility, fish immune system

and palatability by eliminating anti-nutrients, oligosaccharides, and fiber [29]. In the soybean meal fermentation process, the microorganisms that are widely used are *Bacillus* spp., *Aspergillus* spp., and *Lactobacillus* spp. [30,31]. Several studies also explain that the use of fermented soybean meal with *Bacillus* spp. can increase protein content, thioxidative activity, total amino acids, fish digestibility and can reduce anti-nutritional content and immunoreactivity [10]. So that fermentation is highly recommended to increase the utilization of soybean meal [25].

4. NUTRIENTS IN FERMENTATION OF SOYBEAN MEAL IN FISH FEED

Feed ingredients processed by the fermentation process will experience an increase in nutrients such as an increase in protein (38.25% to 44.82%) and increase the digestibility of the feed by reducing the levels of crude fiber and fat [32]. Several studies have stated that fermentation can be used to improve the quality of soybean meal. One of them is the increased content of amino acids in *Bacillus subtilis* fermented soybean meal such as asparagine (10.89%), threonine (3.71%), serine (4%), glucogenic (16.35%), glycine (4.15%), alanine (4.70%), cysteine (1.40%), leucine (8.08%), tyrosine (4.60%), valine (5.83%), and methionine (2.49%). The increase in amino acid content in soybean meal fermentation can be influenced by the type of bacteria used. In addition, the content of phenols and flavonoids in fermented soybean meal also increased significantly from 3.0 to 14.7 mg/g [27]. The nutritional content in fermented soybean meal can improve fish growth performance, physiological conditions of digestion and coefficient of digesting nutrients. The type of fermentation that is widely used is the bacterium *Bacillus subtilis* and *Lactobacillus* spp. [8]. A list of nutrient content and types of fermentation in several studies can be seen in (Table 1.).

5. FERMENTATION OF SOYBEAN MEAL AS FISH FEED

Fermented soybean meal using microorganisms has been widely used in several types of fish and produces soybean meal with a higher preference as a vegetable protein [35]. Fermented soybean meal has been widely used as feed for seabasses [4], green snapper [36], mud grouper [19], rainbow trout [7], pomfret star [8],

Table 1. Nutrient content of fermented soybean meal

Fermentation Type	Crude protein (%)	Carbohydrates (%)	Ash Content (%)	Lipids Rough (%)	References
<i>Bacillus pumillus</i> SE5	42	-	-	10	[4]
<i>Aspergillus awabor</i>	60,58	-	-	2,7	[21]
<i>Bacillus subtilis</i> E20	48,82	-	11.85	7.50	[19]
<i>Bacillus subtilis</i> , <i>Lactobacillus</i> , raji	65.5	-	-	-	[7]
<i>Lactobacillus</i> spp.	50	-	-	-	[8]
<i>Saccharomyces cerevisiae</i>	29,7	57,15	5.91	-	[33]
<i>Bacillus</i> spp .	49,9	21,3	-	-	[34]
<i>Bacillus subtilis</i>	44,82	-	-	-	[27]

Table 2. Growth and optimum dose of fermented soybean meal

Species	Results (WG %)	Optimum Dose	Reference
<i>Lateolabrax maculatus</i>	12.3	26.9-37.1%	[4]
<i>Micropterus salmonides</i>	14.71	30%	[36]
<i>Epinephelus coioides</i>	34.81	29.32%	[19]
<i>Oncorhynchus mykiss</i>	5.5	40%	[7]
<i>Trachinotus blochii</i>	25.3	35%	[8]
<i>Oreochromis niloticus</i>	21.87	37.4%	[33]
<i>Scophthalmus maximus</i> L.	N/A	45%	[21]

* WG : Weight Gain

tilapia [33], and turbot [21], Other research mentions the use of fermented soybean meal using *Bacillus* spp. can produce antibiotics [23] and does not cause any morphological changes in the gut of fish, especially in rainbow trout [35]. Soybean meal fermentation using lactic acid bacteria can increase the acidity of the feed, increase the preferences of the feed, and can produce antimicrobial peptides [37]. Fermented soybean meal using yeast can produce useful components such as mannan oligosaccharides, organic acids, vitamins, antibiotics, β -glucans, and chitin [38]. Components produced from soybean meal fermentation using microbes can increase growth rate, intestinal morphology, intestinal microecology and innate immunity of fish [39,40]. The use of fermented soybean meal in fish has different optimum dose levels and growth (Table 2). This occurs because the types of fish fed with fermented soybean meal are different and the bacteria used are also different. The highest growth was in *Epinephelus coioides* fed soybean meal fermented *Bacillus subtilis* E20 with an optimum dose of 29.32%.

6. CONCLUSION

The use of fermented soybean meal as a substitute for fish meal is an alternative that can be used because the protein content of

fermented soybean meal (29.7 -65.5%) is not much different from fish meal (44.2-58.87%). The best type of fermentation used is fermentation by *Bacillus subtilis* and *Lactobacillus* sp. which produces the highest protein (65.5%). The increase in protein in the fermentation process is influenced by the quality of the feed ingredients and the bacteria used. The highest increase in growth was in *Epinephelus coioides* (34.81%) with an optimum dose of 29.32% fermented soybean meal. The type of fish fed fermented soybean meal greatly influences the increase in fish growth.

COMPETING INTERESTS

Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

REFERENCES

1. Mikdarullah A, Nugraha K, Ikan APT, Yang Berbeda DBL, Bul. Tek. Litkayasa Akuakultur. 2020;18:133-8.
2. Yang H, Bian Y, Huang L, Lan Q, Ma L, Li X, et al. Effects of replacing fish meal with fermented soybean meal on the growth performance, intestinal microbiota, morphology and disease resistance of

- largemouth bass (*Micropterus salmoides*). Aquaculture Reports. 2022;22:100954. DOI: 10.1016/j.aqrep.2021.100954
3. Rahimnejad S, Hu S, Song K, Wang L, Lu K, Wu R, et al. Replacement of fish meal with defatted silkworm (*Bombyx mori* L.) pupae meal in diets for Pacific white shrimp (*Litopenaeus vannamei*). Aquaculture. 2019;510:150-9. DOI: 10.1016/j.aquaculture.2019.05.054
 4. Rahimnejad S, Zhang JJ, Wang L, Sun Y, Zhang C. Evaluation of *Bacillus pumillus* SE5 fermented soybean meal as a fish meal replacer in spotted seabass (*Lateolabrax maculatus*) feed. Aquaculture. 2021;531:735975. DOI: 10.1016/j.aquaculture.2020.735975
 5. Lu F, Alenyorege EA, Ouyang N, Zhou A, Ma H. Simulated natural and high temperature solid-state fermentation of soybean meal: A comparative study regarding microorganisms, functional properties and structural characteristics. LWT. 2022;159:113125. DOI: 10.1016/j.lwt.2022.113125
 6. Amin M, Taqwa FH, Yulisman Y, RC, Mukti, Rarassari MA, et al. (*Clarias* sp.) di Desa Sakatiga. Kecamatan Indralaya, kabupaten Ogan Ilir, Sumatera selatan. J Aquac Fish Heal. 2020;9:222. DOI: 10.20473/jafh.v9i3.17969
 7. Choi DG, He M, Fang H, Wang XL, Li XQ, Leng XJ. Replacement of fish meal with two fermented soybean meals in diets for rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*). Aquacult Nutr. 2020;26(1):37-46. DOI: 10.1111/anu.12965
 8. Nguyen HP, Van Do TV, Tran HD. Dietary replacement of fish meal by defatted and fermented soybean meals with taurine supplementation for pompano fish: effects on growth performance, nutrient digestibility, and biological parameters in a long-term feeding period. J Anim Sci. 2020;98(12):1-9. DOI: 10.1093/JAS/SKAA367, PMID 33201238.
 9. Song Z, Li H, Wang J, Li P, Sun Y, Zhang L. Effects of fishmeal replacement with soy protein hydrolysates on growth performance, blood biochemistry, gastrointestinal digestion and muscle composition of juvenile starry flounder (*Platichthys stellatus*). Aquaculture. 2014; 426-427:96-104. DOI: 10.1016/j.aquaculture.2014.01.002
 10. Teng D, Gao M, Yang Y, Liu B, Tian Z, Wang J. Bio-modification of soybean meal with *Bacillus subtilis* or *Aspergillus oryzae*. Biocatal Agric Biotechnol. 2012;1(1):32-8. DOI: 10.1016/j.bcab.2011.08.005
 11. Gatlin DM, Barrows FT, Brown P, Dabrowski K, Gaylord TG, Hardy RW, et al. Expanding the utilization of sustainable plant products in aquafeeds: A review. Res. 2007;38(6):551-79. DOI: 10.1111/j.1365-2109.2007.01704.x
 12. Pamungkas W, Fermentasi T. Teknologi Fermentasi. Alternatif solusi dalam upaya pemanfaatan bahan pakan lokal. Media Akuakultur. 2011;6(1):43. DOI: 10.15578/ma.6.1.2011.43-48
 13. Suryani Y, Hernaman I, Ningsih N, Urea PP. Dan Sulfur pada limbah padat bioetanol Yang Difermentasi Em-4 terhadap kandungan protein Dan serat kasar. J Ilm Peternak Terpadu. 2017;5:13. DOI: 10.23960/jipt.v5i1.p13-17
 14. Hong KJ, Lee CH, Kim SW. *Aspergillus oryzae* GB-107 fermentation improves nutritional quality of food soybeans and feed soybean meals. J Med Food. 2004; 7(4):430-5. DOI: 10.1089/jmf.2004.7.430, PMID 15671685.
 15. Meng F, Li B, Xie Y, Li M, Wang RX. Substituting fish meal with extruded soybean meal in diets did not affect the growth performance, hepatic enzyme activities, but hypoxia tolerance of Dolly Varden (*Salvelinus malma*) juveniles. Aquac. 2020;51:1-10.
 16. Zhang YQ, Ji WX, Wu YB, Han H, Qin JG, Wang Y. Replacement of dietary fish meal by soybean meal supplemented with crystalline methionine for Japanese sea bass (*Lateolabrax japonicus*), Aquac. 2016;47:1-10.
 17. Liu T, Han T, Wang J, Liu T, Bian P, Wang Y, et al. Effects of replacing fish meal with soybean meal on growth performance, feed utilization and physiological status of juvenile redlip mullet *Liza haematocheila*. Aquaculture Reports. 2021;20:100756. DOI: 10.1016/j.aqrep.2021.100756
 18. Pervin MA, Jahan H, Akter R, Omri A, Hossain Z. Appraisal of different levels of soybean meal in diets on growth, digestive enzyme activity, antioxidation, and gut histology of tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus*). Fish Physiol Biochem. 2020;46(4): 1397-407.

- DOI: 10.1007/s10695-020-00798-5, PMID 32222857.
19. Shiu YL, Hsieh SL, Guei WC, Tsai YT, Chiu CH, Liu CH. Using *Bacillus subtilis* E20-fermented soybean meal as replacement for fish meal in the diet of orange-spotted grouper (*Epinephelus coioides*, Hamilton), Aquac. Res. 2015; 46(6):1403-16.
DOI: 10.1111/are.12294
 20. Wang L, Jian Y, Liu Q, Li F, Chang L. Electromagnetohydrodynamic flow and heat transfer of third grade fluids between two micro-parallel plates. Colloids Surf A Physicochem Eng Asp. 2016;494: 87-94.
DOI: 10.1016/j.colsurfa.2016.01.006
 21. Li C, Zhang B, Zhou H, Wang X, Pi X, Wang X, et al. Beneficial influences of dietary *Aspergillus awamori* fermented soybean meal on oxidative homeostasis and inflammatory response in turbot (*Scophthalmus maximus* L.). Fish Shellfish Immunol. 2019;93:8-16.
DOI: 10.1016/j.fsi.2019.07.037, PMID 31319205.
 22. Ye JD, Liu XH, Wang ZJ, Wang KK. Effect of partial fish meal replacement by soybean meal on the growth performance and biochemical indices of juvenile Japanese flounder *Paralichthys olivaceus*. Aquacult Int. 2011;19(1):143-53.
DOI: 10.1007/s10499-010-9348-1
 23. Cheng AC, Lin HL, Shiu YL, Tyan YC, Liu CH. Isolation and characterization of antimicrobial peptides derived from *Bacillus subtilis* E20-fermented soybean meal and its use for preventing *Vibrio* infection in shrimp aquaculture. Fish Shellfish Immunol. 2017;67:270-9.
DOI: 10.1016/j.fsi.2017.06.006, PMID 28602685.
 24. Pan L, Liu J, Hamdy Farouk MH, Qin G, Bao N, Zhao Y, et al. Anti-nutritional characteristics and mechanism of soybean agglutinin. Biol Cell. 2021;45(3):451-9.
DOI: 10.32604/BIOCELL.2021.014289
 25. Wang Z, Yang M, Wang L, Lu K, Song K, Zhang C. *Bacillus subtilis* LCBS1 supplementation and replacement of fish meal with fermented soybean meal in bullfrog (*Lithobates catesbeianus*) diets: effects on growth performance, feed digestibility and gut health. Aquaculture. 2021;545:737217.
DOI: 10.1016/j.aquaculture.2021.737217
 26. PPrastyawan RM, Tampoebolon BIM, Surono, Peningkatan Kualitas Tongkol Jagung Melalui Teknologi Amoniasi Fermentasi (Amofer) Terhadap Kecernaan Bahan Kering Dan Bahan Organik Serta Protein Total Secara *In vitro*, Anim. Agric. J. 2012;1:611–621.
 27. Dai C, Ma H, He R, Huang L, Zhu S, Ding Q, et al. Improvement of nutritional value and bioactivity of soybean meal by solid-state fermentation with *Bacillus subtilis*. LWT. 2017;86:1-7.
DOI: 10.1016/j.lwt.2017.07.041
 28. Zhang B, Zhang Y, Cui M, Zhang M, Xu J, Zhang Z, et al. Comparison of the performance of raw and *Lactobacillus paracasei* fermented soybean meal in diets for turbot (*Scophthalmus maximus* L.): growth, intestinal morphology, apoptosis, tight junction, and microbiota, Aquac. Reports. 2022;24:101184.
DOI: 10.1016/j.aqrep.(2022).101184
 29. Liang XF, Hu L, Dong YC, Wu XF, Qin YC, Zheng YH, et al. Substitution of fish meal by fermented soybean meal affects the growth performance and flesh quality of Japanese seabass (*Lateolabrax japonicus*). Anim Feed Sci Technol. 2017; 229:1-12.
DOI: 10.1016/j.anifeedsci.2017.03.006.
 30. Chi CH, Cho SJ. Improvement of bioactivity of soybean meal by solid-state fermentation with *Bacillus amyloliquefaciens* versus *Lactobacillus* spp. and *Saccharomyces cerevisiae*. LWT. 2016;68:619-25.
DOI: 10.1016/j.lwt.2015.12.002
 31. Suryaningrum LS. Aplikasi mikroba pada upaya peningkatan kualitas bahan baku pakan ikan melalui fermentasi, Pros. Biol Achiev Sustain Dev Goals Biodivers Confronting Clim Chang. 2021:204-10.
 32. Rostika R, Safitri R. Influence of fish feed containing corn-cob was fermented by *Trichoderma* sp, *Aspergillus* sp, *Rhizopus Oligosporus* To the rate of growth of java barb (*Puntius gonionitus*). APCBEE Procedia. 2012;2:148-52.
DOI: 10.1016/j.apcbee.2012.06.027
 33. Hassaan MS, Soltan MA, Abdel-Moez AM. Nutritive value of soybean meal after solid state fermentation with *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* for Nile tilapia, *Oreochromis niloticus*. Anim Feed Sci Technol. 2015; 201:89-98.
DOI: 10.1016/j.anifeedsci.2015.01.007

34. Yamamoto T, Iwashita Y, Matsunari H, Sugita T, Furuita H, Akimoto A, et al. Influence of fermentation conditions for soybean meal in a non-fish meal diet on the growth performance and physiological condition of rainbow trout *Oncorhynchus mykiss*. *Aquaculture*. 2010;309(1-4):173-80.
DOI: 10.1016/j.aquaculture.2010.09.021
35. Barnes ME, Brown ML, Rosentrater KA, Sewell JR. An initial investigation replacing fish meal with a commercial fermented soybean meal product in the diets of juvenile rainbow trout. *Open J Anim Sci*. 2012;02(4):234-43.
DOI: 10.4236/ojas.2012.24033
36. He M, Li X, Poolsawat L, Guo Z, Yao W, Zhang C, et al. Effects of fish meal replaced by fermented soybean meal on growth performance, intestinal histology and microbiota of largemouth bass (*Micropterus salmoides*). *Aquacult Nutr*. 2020;26(4):1058-71.
DOI: 10.1111/anu.13064
37. Sanjukta S, Rai AK. Production of bioactive peptides during soybean fermentation and their potential health benefits. *Trends Food Sci Technol*. 2016; 50:1-10.
DOI: 10.1016/j.tifs.2016.01.010
38. Faustino M, Durão J, Pereira CF, Pintado ME, Carvalho AP. Mannans and mannan oligosaccharides (MOS) from *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* – A sustainable source of functional ingredients. *Carbohydr Polym*. 2021;272:118467.
DOI: 10.1016/j.carbpol.2021.118467, PMID 34420726.
39. Silva-Carrillo Y, Hernández C, Hardy RW, González-Rodríguez B, Castillo-Vargasmachuca S. The effect of substituting fish meal with soybean meal on growth, feed efficiency, body composition and blood chemistry in juvenile spotted rose snapper *Lutjanus guttatus* (Steindachner, 1869). *Aquaculture*. 2012;364-365:180-5.
DOI: 10.1016/j.aquaculture.2012.08.007
40. Li L, Song J, Peng C, Yang Z, Wang L, Lin J, et al. Co-occurrence network of microbes linking growth and immunity parameters with the gut microbiota in Nile tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus*) after feeding with fermented soybean meal. *Aquaculture Reports*. 2022;26.
DOI: 10.1016/j.aqrep.2022.101280

© 2022 Pratiwy and Triyani; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0>), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Peer-review history:
The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here:
<https://www.sdiarticle5.com/review-history/94720>